



BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL

MEETING OF THE OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY BOARD

MONDAY 3RD SEPTEMBER 2018
AT 6.00 P.M.

PARKSIDE SUITE - PARKSIDE

MEMBERS: Councillors L. C. R. Mallett (Chairman), S. A. Webb (Vice-Chairman), C. Allen-Jones, C. J. Bloore, S. R. Colella, R. J. Deeming, M. Glass, C.A. Hotham, R. J. Laight, P.L. Thomas and M. Thompson

AGENDA

1. Apologies for Absence and Named Substitutes
2. Declarations of Interest and Whipping Arrangements

To invite Councillors to declare any Disclosable Pecuniary Interests or Other Disclosable Interests they may have in items on the agenda, and to confirm the nature of those interests.
3. To confirm the accuracy of the minutes of the meeting of the Overview and Scrutiny Board held on 18th June 2018 (Pages 1 - 8)
4. Anti-social Behaviour, Crime and Policing Act 2014 (Implementation of Provisions) - TO FOLLOW
5. Pre-Scrutiny - Council Tax Support Scheme Review - TO FOLLOW
6. Hospital Car Parking Charges - Board Investigation Final Report (Pages 9 - 18)
7. Corporate Performance Working Group - Update
8. Finance and Budget Working Group - Update

9. Task Group Updates
 - Road Safety Around Schools Task and Finish Group
 - CCTV Short Sharp Review
10. Worcestershire Health Overview and Scrutiny Committee - Update
11. Cabinet Work Programme - TO BE TABLED AT THE MEETING
12. Overview and Scrutiny Board Work Programme (Pages 19 - 22)

K. DICKS
Chief Executive

Parkside
Market Street
BROMSGROVE
Worcestershire
B61 8DA

23rd August 2018



INFORMATION FOR THE PUBLIC

Access to Information

The Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985 widened the rights of press and public to attend Local Authority meetings and to see certain documents. Recently the Freedom of Information Act 2000 has further broadened these rights, and limited exemptions under the 1985 Act.

- You can attend all Council, Cabinet and Committee/Board meetings, except for any part of the meeting when the business would disclose confidential or “exempt” information.
- You can inspect agenda and public reports at least five days before the date of the meeting.
- You can inspect minutes of the Council, Cabinet and its Committees/Boards for up to six years following a meeting.
- You can have access, upon request, to the background papers on which reports are based for a period of up to six years from the date of the meeting. These are listed at the end of each report.
- An electronic register stating the names and addresses and electoral areas of all Councillors with details of the membership of all Committees etc. is available on our website.
- A reasonable number of copies of agendas and reports relating to items to be considered in public will be made available to the public attending meetings of the Council, Cabinet and its Committees/Boards.
- You have access to a list specifying those powers which the Council has delegated to its Officers indicating also the titles of the Officers concerned, as detailed in the Council’s Constitution, Scheme of Delegation.

You can access the following documents:

- Meeting Agendas
- Meeting Minutes
- The Council’s Constitution

at www.bromsgrove.gov.uk

This page is intentionally left blank

BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL

MEETING OF THE OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY BOARD

18TH JUNE 2018, AT 6.00 P.M.

PRESENT: Councillors L. C. R. Mallett (Chairman), S. A. Webb (Vice-Chairman), C. Allen-Jones, C. J. Bloore, R. J. Deeming, M. Glass, C.A. Hotham, R. J. Laight, P.L. Thomas and M. Thompson

Observers: Councillor P. J. Whittaker

Officers: Ms. J. Pickering, Ms J. Willis, Ms. B. Houghton, Ms. A. Scarce and Mrs L. Morris

15/18 **APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE AND NAMED SUBSTITUTES**

Apologies were received from Councillor S.R. Colella.

It was noted that Councillor M. Thompson had replaced Councillor P. McDonald on the Board.

16/18 **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST AND WHIPPING ARRANGEMENTS**

Councillor L.C.R Mallett (Chairman) and Councillor C.A. Hotham declared an interest in the Hospital Carparking Task and Finish Group Update item.

17/18 **TO CONFIRM THE ACCURACY OF THE MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY BOARD HELD ON 24 MAY 2018.**

RESOLVED that the minutes of the Overview and Scrutiny Board meeting held on the 24 May 2018 be approved as an accurate record.

18/18 **SCRUTINY OF THE CRIME AND DISORDER PARTNERSHIP**

Bev Houghton, Community Safety Manager, provided an update on the progress of the North Worcestershire Community Safety Partnership (NWCSP) during 2017/18. A number of key points were highlighted including that;

- Local authorities had a statutory duty to scrutinise the work of the local Community Safety Partnership (CSP) under Section 19 of the Police and Justice Act 2006.
- The NWCSP had a statutory duty to produce a Partnership Plan outlining how it would address key crime and community safety priorities.

Agenda Item 3

Overview and Scrutiny Board
18th June 2018

- The Police and Crime Commissioner (PCC) had a duty to co-operate with the CSP to reduce crime and disorder and there was a reciprocal duty on the CSP to collaborate with the PCC.
- Grant funding was available from the PCC. Money had been allocated to a number of projects across the 3 district areas.
- A new Community Guardians project had been proposed which would create a team of officers to patrol areas of concern in terms of anti-social behaviour.
- There had been a separate allocation of just under £200,000 to improve CCTV in North Worcestershire. A consultant review had been funded.
- Some of the Safer Bromsgrove reserves had been invested in retaining a dedicated Community Safety Officer. The Officer had worked in for example the Lowes Hills Ward to address anti-social behaviour alongside the Police and the local school.
- There had been work in Tardebigge to address anti-social behaviour including open water swimming in the summer holidays.
- There was a Town Centres Management Group which was working to identify community safety issues, particularly around the Night Time Economy.
- A Nominated Neighbours Scheme had been introduced to deter rogue traders. This directed callers to a nominated neighbour so that vulnerable people did not need to open the door until their identification had been checked. This scheme would be reviewed in six to nine months' time but initial feedback had been positive and there had been a drop in rogue callers being reported. There was work being carried out to ensure that Lifeline customers had access to this scheme.
- The Respect Programme continued to be delivered in schools.
- A Youth and Community Hub was being set up in the basement of the Baptist Church in New Road and a project manager appointed. The official launch of the Hub would be on the 18 July 2018.
- The Youth Citizens Challenge continued to deliver personal safety messages and information to Year 6 pupils.
- During Hate Crime Awareness Week there had been a number of community engagement events funded by the PCC. A Street Theatre Company engaged with residents through performances, information bags had been handed out and there had been promotion on Twitter and Facebook.
- There was work with the Policy Team to consider the information gathered through the District Community Panel Survey to identify community safety target areas.

Members' queried if the CCTV Task and Finish Group's work would feed into the CCTV work being undertaken by the partnership and the Community Safety Manager confirmed that the findings of the Group would be shared with the Overview and Scrutiny Board and decision making would be with Cabinet accordingly.

Agenda Item 3

Overview and Scrutiny Board
18th June 2018

Members referred to the possible impact of development choices and planning decisions on crime and the night time economy and the Community Safety Manager responded that Town Centre crime was considered during the day and at night time. There had been an issue with young people climbing roofs and running across them for example. These types of issues could be addressed by better planning and design.

It was queried by Members' if there were as many anti-social behaviour issues in relation to restaurants, as well as pubs and clubs and the Community Safety Manager referred to a well-established Pub Watch scheme in Bromsgrove with individuals taking on various responsibilities for certain aspects of the running of the group, such as managing the information sharing system etc. A taxi marshalling scheme had been funded via the PCC grant and had proved to be very successful in moving people out of the area quickly. The Partnership was looking to repeat this. There were fewer issues outside restaurants than pubs and clubs.

Regarding the work at the Baptist Church Members queried the support of other faith denominations and if there was work with other denominations. The Community Safety Manager explained that there was a thriving mosque in Bromsgrove and there were good relationships with local communities The youth hub had been set up by partners which included a number of denominations and there were links made with other communities through the various partnership projects.

In response to questions from Members' it was clarified by the Community Safety Manager that Lifeline customers had already nominated family and friend contacts. The Police and Fire service could also report people to the scheme. The Nominated Neighbour sticker could discourage rogue traders. If the nominated neighbour was not in then genuine traders would leave a note but rogue traders would be put off.

In relation to inconsiderate parking the Community Safety Manager explained that traffic regulation matters were the responsibility of the County Council. Inconsiderate parking was more of a social issue. A variety of services needed to come together to have an impact

Members' raised the issue of derelict insecure buildings and asked if there was the potential for the local authority to place a clean-up order on derelict buildings where the landlord appeared reluctant to secure the site. Concerns about drug selling and usage centred around a derelict building on Blackmore Lane were raised and the work underway to have trees cut back, street lighting improved and graffiti cleared up was referred to. The Police's input was not however clear to local residents. Potential opportunities to put in place Anti-Social Behaviour Notices and for the community to trigger a response from agencies were discussed.

Agenda Item 3

Overview and Scrutiny Board
18th June 2018

The Community Safety Manager explained that in the past a Section 29 Order had been used to encourage a landowner to take action to address a derelict building. Section 215 Orders had to be undertaken by Planning. There were regular conversations with Worcestershire Regulatory Services, Legal and Planning Officers regarding derelict buildings and this was a priority in relation to addressing and preventing matters such as ASB, fire setting and potentially Child Sexual Exploitation.

Councillor Whittaker, Portfolio Holder for Community Safety and Leisure and Cultural Services confirmed that he was aware of the issues at Blackmore Lane and had raised the matter with the Police and colleagues at the Community Safety Partnership meeting. It was anticipated that the matter would now be resolved.

In response to concerns raised by Members' about cannabis use, the Community Safety Manager clarified that data was taken from the number of reports to the Police so it was important to report concerns as matters would be prioritised based on these reports. The Community Panel survey had identified fears regarding drug dealing. The distribution and supply of illegal substances was a key focus for the police and partners. In terms of individual use of cannabis it would be hard to identify and take action against people just from the smell alone.

The Community Safety Manager confirmed that the Community Guardian scheme was not linked to any possible merger of the Police and Fire service. The scheme was developed in response to a lack of trained detached youth workers in the District. Fire Officers were being considered as potential deliverers of the project as part of their expansion into other types of work in the community. There had been a role modelling project where by Fire Officers had engaged with young people and the Community Guardians Project built upon this.

Members' expressed their appreciation and endorsed the work of the Community Safety Project Officer. A number of points were raised and in response it was confirmed by the Community Safety Manager that;

- The Community Safety Project Officer role had been funded from external grant reserves. There was partnership funding available for this role until 2020.
- Bromsgrove Community Safety Partnership had had healthy reserves when it merged into the North Worcestershire partnership. North Worcestershire had the most Community Safety Officers in the county. There would need to be a corporate budget bid or an increase in grant funding to increase the number of Officers in the future.
- The PCC would not fund the Community Safety Project Officer post as the Police provided Community Support Officers who would be considered the equivalent to the Community Safety Project Officer role.

Agenda Item 3

Overview and Scrutiny Board
18th June 2018

- Budget Bids would be put forward by Heads of Service and then considered by the Budget Working Group, the Overview and Scrutiny Board, Cabinet and Council.
- Grants were applied for as and when they were made available and Officers found out about them.
- There was qualitative information about the impact of the role of the Community Safety Project Officer. There could be consideration of the number of recorded anti-social behaviour incidents before and after intervention by the Project Officer however this may not provide a true picture as it was the Project Officer's role to get partners together to address the problem rather than to do it themselves.

Members queried the status of the Smart Water scheme and it was confirmed that this was a police project.

In response to Members' questions the Senior Democratic Services Officer clarified that the numbers of people on the Community Panel had reduced and new people were being encouraged to join. She advised that the Panel could be a useful resource when undertaking overview and scrutiny work. Leaflets were available about the Panel and there was also information online. Members of the Panel had been approached to provide consent to receive information as part of the General Data Protection Regulations but a number had not responded which had led to a depleted Panel

RESOLVED that the North Worcestershire Community Safety Partnership update be noted.

19/18

RECOMMENDATIONS TRACKER

The Senior Democratic Service Officer highlighted a number of recommendations that had been completed and suggested that these could now be removed from the Recommendation Tracker.

There were a number of financial recommendations which had also been completed and any outstanding actions would be addressed by the Executive Director for Finance and Resources.

RESOLVED that the recommendation tracker be updated as discussed above.

20/18

FINANCE AND BUDGET WORKING GROUP - UPDATE

This group had not met since the previous Board meeting but was due to meet on 26th June..

21/18

CORPORATE PERFORMANCE WORKING GROUP - UPDATE

This Working Group would be meeting in the next week and an update would be provided at the next Board meeting.

22/18

TASK GROUP UPDATES

The CCTV Short Sharp Review Group met on the 30 May 2018 and had considered the interim report reviewing the CCTV systems. The Group would meet again in September to consider the final findings of the review and any recommendations for the Board's consideration.

Councillor C. Bloore reported that the Hospital Car parking Board Investigation group would be meeting again in July and reporting back to the Board in September.

Councillor C. Bloore explained that Members' of the Road Safety Around Schools Task and Finish Group had visited outside a school with an Enforcement Officer and would be meeting again shortly to discuss their findings and to take up matters with representatives from the Police. It was anticipated that their report would be presented to the September meeting of the Board.

23/18

WORCESTERSHIRE HEALTH OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE - UPDATE

Councillor C. Bloore confirmed that the Committee had not met since the previous Board meeting. He understood that currently there were concerns being raised about service changes at Kidderminster and the use of the Alex Hospital in Redditch for A&E services.

24/18

CABINET WORK PROGRAMME

It was reported that Officers were still awaiting a response from Worcestershire County Council regarding the Transport Planning Report.

It was suggested by the Chairman that the item on the Council Tax Support Scheme be added to the Board's Work Programme for pre-scrutiny.

RESOLVED:

- a) that the Board send a letter to the County Council expressing disappointment that a response had not yet been received.
that Councillor C. Bloore take up the matter with County Councillor K. Pollock, Cabinet Member for Economy and Infrastructure.

25/18

OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY BOARD WORK PROGRAMME

The Senior Democratic Services Officer confirmed that the CCTV Short Sharp Review Group would report back their findings to the Board in October. Anti-Social Behaviour would be discussed in more detail at the September Board meeting.

RESOLVED that the Board Work Programme be amended in line with discussions.

Agenda Item 3

Overview and Scrutiny Board
18th June 2018

26/18

TO CONSIDER ANY OTHER BUSINESS, DETAILS OF WHICH HAVE BEEN NOTIFIED TO THE HEAD OF LEGAL, EQUALITIES AND DEMOCRATIC SERVICES PRIOR TO THE COMMENCEMENT OF THE MEETING AND WHICH THE CHAIRMAN, BY REASON OF SPECIAL CIRCUMSTANCES, CONSIDERS TO BE OF SO URGENT A NATURE THAT IT CANNOT WAIT UNTIL THE NEXT MEETING.

The meeting closed at 7.05 p.m.

Chairman

This page is intentionally left blank

OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY BOARD

3rd September 2018

HOSPITAL CARPARKING CHARGES BOARD INVESTIGATION

Relevant Portfolio Holder	Councillor M. A. Sherrey, Portfolio Holder for Health, Wellbeing and Environmental Services
Portfolio Holder Consulted	Yes
Relevant Head of Service for Overview and Scrutiny	Claire Felton – Head of Legal, Equalities and Democratic Services
Wards Affected	All Wards
Ward Councillor Consulted	Board Investigation

1. SUMMARY OF PROPOSALS

To consider the findings and recommendations from the Overview and Scrutiny Board’s investigation.

2. RECOMMENDATIONS

2.1 Members are requested to:

- (a) consider and approve the report and the recommendation included within the report; and
- (b) submit the report and recommendation to Full Council for approval.

3. KEY ISSUES

Financial Implications

3.1 N/A

Legal Implications

3.2 N/A

Service/Operation Implications

3.3 Overview and scrutiny is a key part of the Council’s democratic decision making process and enables non-executive Members of the Council to put forward recommendations for policy development, policy review and service improvement.

OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY BOARD

3rd September 2018

Customer / Equalities and Diversity Implications

3.4 N/A

4. RISK MANAGEMENT

4.1 N/A

5. APPENDICES

Board Investigation Report

6. BACKGROUND PAPERS

See attached report for details.

7. KEY

None

AUTHOR OF REPORT

Name: Amanda Scarce – Democratic Services Officer
E Mail: a.scarce@bromsgroveandredditch.gov.uk
Tel: 01527 881443

BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY BOARD **3RD SEPTEMBER 2018**

Hospital Car Parking Charges Board Investigation

1. Background Information

- 1.1 At the Council meeting on the 19th July 2017, Councillor Peter McDonald proposed the following motion which was seconded by Councillor Michael Thompson; *“This Council calls upon all local hospitals to stop charging for parking, that in reality is financially punishing people for receiving treatment or visiting loved ones”*

Following discussion, Members felt that it would be appropriate to consider the matter further as it was an issue which had an impact on local residents. It was therefore agreed that the matter be referred to the Overview and Scrutiny Board for investigation.

- 1.2 At the 22nd August 2017 Overview and Scrutiny Board meeting, Members considered the Investigation Proposal. Whilst concerns had been raised in the motion to Council regarding the impact of parking charges on patients and their families it was noted that some of the content of the motion was factually incorrect. A number of Members who had recently visited hospitals in the county noted that signs were on display in the car parks and these clearly advised patients and visitors that, after covering the costs of maintaining the car parks, any revenue would be reinvested in hospital services. Members discussed the subject of hospital car parking charges in further detail and in so doing noted the following;

- Concessionary charges were in place and patients / visitors could reclaim costs in certain circumstances.
- Many residents on low incomes would struggle to pay these charges and as such they might be regarded as unfairly penalising people with financial difficulties.
- Concerns were raised that a private company maintained the charging system on behalf of the Worcestershire Acute Hospital NHS Trust (WAHT) and this company might be generating a profit from charging patients and their families.
- The Council did not have the power to make decisions in respect of the charges levied by the Trust for parking at hospitals in the county.
- There was the possibility that this subject might be suitable to refer to the Worcestershire Health Overview and Scrutiny Committee (HOSC) for further investigation.

- 1.3 On the 30th October 2017 a briefing paper was provided to the Board which gave details of the concessionary scheme in place and comparative data in respect of car parking charges made by a number of other Hospital Trusts. Whilst considering the information Members discussed a number of areas in detail including:

- That the concessionary charges appeared not to be well publicised – it was confirmed that these were included on the car park signage and that more details were available from the relevant Wards.
- The lack of information in respect of the breakdown of income received from the car parks and detail in respect of the PFI contract.
- The option for the Board to write to the Secretary of State airing its concerns around car parking charges being used to top up hospital budgets which were under significant pressure.
- This was a problem which was not unique to Worcestershire.
- The need for a breakdown of the ongoing maintenance costs associated with the car parks.

1.4 Following discussion, a Board Investigation, led by Councillors Bloore (Chairman), Allen-Jones, Colella, and S.Webb was undertaken. The Board Investigation Group has held two meetings and has had the opportunity to discuss the issue with a representative from WAHT to clarify a number of points.

2. Summary of Findings

- 2.1 From the outset of this investigation, concern was raised that a private company maintained the parking charging system on behalf of the WAHT and this company might be generating a profit from charging patients and their families. This investigation however has revealed that this is not the case as no external company takes a slice of the income from car parking charges other than the money paid towards the Private Finance Initiative (PFI) costs at the Worcestershire Royal Hospital. The Trust operates all three carparks and other than the money paid towards the PFI costs at the Worcestershire Royal Hospital, any profit generated from parking charges goes back into the operation of the Trust.
- 2.2 Members' had initially raised concerns regarding concessions and how they were advertised. During this investigation however reassurance was provided that information about concessions was provided on a ward by ward basis and was linked to a patient's treatment pathway.
- 2.3 It was noted that hospital car parking charges have been abolished elsewhere in the United Kingdom and that there was a Private Members Bill going through Parliament requesting the abolishment of hospital car parking charges which was sponsored by Labour and Conservative MPs.
- 2.4 Members' have discussed the evidence presented and possible ways to change the system so that car parking charges do not disproportionately affect the disadvantaged. It was suggested for example that potentially those that could prove they were receiving Universal Credit could access free parking, however the possible high costs of administering such a system was referred to. It was also commented that people who found employment stopped receiving Universal Credit and therefore could have no income for a period of time and become for example reliant on pay day loans. Other people lived on low weekly incomes and did not have the budget to pay for parking. It

was recognised that these people would be hit disproportionality by hospital car parking charges.

- 2.5 Although it was acknowledged that abolishing charges would have a financial impact on NHS Trusts and the government would therefore need to contribute to subsidise NHS Trusts, the principle of abolishing hospital car parking charges was felt to be correct.

The Overview and Scrutiny Board therefore recommend the following:

RECOMMEND:

That Full Council write to the Secretary of State to suggest that NHS Trust owned hospital car parks should be made free of charge.

3 Local Hospital Car Parking Charges and Concessions

- 3.1 NHS Trusts and Foundation Trusts in England set their own parking charges for patients, visitors and staff. Details of WAHT car parking charges and arrangements are available on the Trust's website at;

Worcestershire Royal Hospital - <http://www.worcsacute.nhs.uk/our-hospitals/worcestershire-royal-hospital/parking>

Alexandra Hospital - <http://www.worcsacute.nhs.uk/our-hospitals/alexandra-hospital-redditch/parking>

Kidderminster Hospital and Treatment Centre-
<http://www.worcsacute.nhs.uk/our-hospitals/kidderminster-hospital-and-treatment-centre/parking>

- 3.2 In an interview with the Director of Asset Management and ICT, WAHT, it was confirmed that the Trust charged the same for car parking at each of three hospital sites and that the charges had not increased for approximately six years. The Trust currently charges the following;

Up to one hour: £2.50

1-2 hours: £3.70

2-4 hours: £4.50

4-6 hours: £6.00

6-24 hours: £7.50

- 3.3 The level of charges are monitored against a number of local comparators and show that the Trust's charges are in most cases very slightly below the local Trust average.

Table 1 – A Comparison of local NHS Trust Car Parking Charges
(table supplied by Worcestershire Acute Hospitals NHS Trust)

Up to	1 hour	1.5 hour	2 hour	3 hour	4 hour	5 hour	6 hour	7 hour	8 hour	9 hour	24 hour	Blue Disabled Badge Holders
Worcestershire Acute NHS Trust	£2.50	£3.70	£3.70	£4.50	£4.50	£6.00	£6.00	£7.50	£7.50	£7.50	£7.50	Standard Charges Apply
Sandwell & West BM Hospitals NHS Trust	£2.80	£3.80	£3.80	£4.30	£4.80	£4.80	£5.30	£5.30	£5.30	£5.30	£5.30	Standard Charges Apply
University Hospitals of Nth Midlands	£1.80	£3.00	£3.00	£4.00	£4.00	£6.90	£6.90	£6.90	£6.90	£6.90	£9.00	Standard Charges Apply
Heart of England	£3.10	£3.10	£3.10	£5.10	£5.10	£7.20	£7.20	£10.20	£10.20	£10.20	£10.20	Concession Charges Apply
The Dudley Group NHS Foundation	£2.60	£3.60	£4.60	£4.60	£5.60	£5.60	£5.60	£5.60	£5.60	£5.60	£5.60	Free
The Royal Wolverhampton NHS Trust	£2.40	£3.40	£3.40	£3.70	£4.80	£5.10	£5.80	£6.40	£6.60	£7.20	£7.30	Standard Charges Apply
University Hospitals Coventry & Warwickshire	£2.50	£3.40	£3.40	£4.10	£4.90	£6.40	£7.90	£9.20	£9.20	£9.20	£9.20	Standard Charges Apply
Wye Valley NHS Trust	£3.50	£5.00	£5.00	£6.00	£7.00	£8.00	£12.00	£12.00	£12.00	£12	£15.00	Concession Charges Apply
Average	£2.67	£3.61	£3.76	£4.54	£5.17	£6.29	£7.24	£7.94	£7.97	£8	£8.80	

3.4 In 2014, the Department of Health published non-mandatory guidelines on NHS patient, visitor and staff car parking principles. These principles state that; *‘Concessions, including free or reduced charges or caps, should be available for the following groups: disabled people, frequent outpatient attenders, visitors with relatives who are gravely ill, or carers of such people, visitors to relatives who have an extended stay in hospital, or carers of such people, carers of people in the above groups where appropriate, staff working shifts that mean public transport cannot be used. Other concessions, eg for volunteers or staff who car-share, should be considered locally.’*

3.5 Information regarding the WAHT’s concessionary car parking tickets was referred to at the Overview and Scrutiny Board on the 30th October 2017. This document provides details of;

- The £1 per day parking charge for patients/relatives who fall into certain categories.
- The £8.00 next of kin (maximum two persons) seven consecutive day ticket to visit patients who are in hospital for longer than four days.
- The £1 weekly ticket for patients who are visiting the Renal Unit or Radiotherapy unit for treatment on a long term basis and relatives of long stay patients (over two months) (valid for next of kin, two persons only).
- If out-patient clinics run over time, patients are eligible to only pay the minimum car parking fee (one hour fee).
- The nominal fee of £10 per year for patients who are likely to be attending for dialysis frequently and life-long.

3.6 The document states that out of hours in extreme circumstances, discretion will be used to allow visitors free exit from car parks and that any patient/relative who is entitled to receive concessionary parking must complete the appropriate form which is kept at ward level and only issued to those patients/relatives who fall into the appropriate category. The form must be signed and dated by the ward manager/departmental head. Without the form, no concessionary ticket will be issued. Visitors to outpatient clinics are able to obtain a pre-validated ticket from the ward manager. The visitor will take the ticket to the pay on foot machine, insert a £1 and the ticket will be validated to allow exit from the car park.

- 3.7 Members raised concerns about how concessions are publicised. Advice on the Trust's website, available at <http://www.worcsacute.nhs.uk/our-hospitals/worcestershire-royal-hospital/car-parking-concessions>, states that; *'If you are visiting an immediate relative who is a long-stay patient or you are a patient receiving regular treatment, you may be eligible for a reduced-fee parking pass. Please speak to the nurse in charge of the ward/department for more information and an application form. Concessions are available in the following areas: Terminally ill, Cardiac Exercise, Coronary Care Unit (CCU), Intensive Therapy Unit / Critical Care Unit (ITU), Oncology, Paediatrics, Bereavement, Renal unit and Long stay'*
- 3.8 The position was further clarified in discussion with the Director of Asset Management and ICT who explained that concessions are available for patients who have a type of condition that means that they have to regularly return to hospital for treatment. They are not based on the severity of the illness but on how regular hospital visits are required. Passes are allocated by ward staff. The parking teams never debate with clinical teams about who should have access to concessionary parking. Linking concessions to the patient's care pathway works well and people receive information about concessionary parking charges when accessing treatment. In addition visitors to the Critical Care Unit are not charged by the hour for parking as it is acknowledged that their loved ones could be very ill and they may wish to spend long periods of time with them.
- 3.9 With regards to Blue Badge Holders, non-mandatory guidelines on NHS patient, visitor and staff car parking principles states that; *'Consideration should be given to the needs of people with temporary disabilities as well as Blue Badge holders.'* It was however confirmed by the Director of Asset Management and ICT that whilst Blue Badge Holders do have spaces allocated nearer to the hospitals, they are charged at the same rate as none Blue Badge Holders as the Trust wishes to avoid people comparing ailments. From the information provided about comparative parking charges it appears that other Trusts take the same approach (see Table 1 at 3.3)

4. Management and Maintenance

- 4.1 During the Board's Investigation it was established that the Worcestershire Royal Hospital was built under PFI whilst the Alexandra Hospital in Redditch and the Kidderminster Hospital and Treatment Centre are both owned by the Trust. The arrangements for the up keep of the Trust's car parks therefore vary.
- 4.2 The Trust is responsible for the security, maintenance and management of all three car parks, however external contractors do this on a day to day basis. For example, whilst the Trust owns and operates its own lighting, parking machines and barriers, the suppliers of this equipment are contracted to maintain it. Parking attendants, ticketing and security are paid on an annual basis at each of the three sites.

- 4.3 The Worcestershire Royal Hospital site is not fully owned by the Trust and there are therefore PFI costs associated with the carpark, with finance to repay on the original build and the annual reoccurring cost within the PFI for the maintenance of the carpark. Due to the PFI arrangements at the Worcestershire Royal Hospital there are more consistent costs for the maintenance of the carparks for this site however the amount spent on the Redditch and Kidderminster hospital carparks' vary depending on the needs of each carpark.
- 4.4 If payment machines or barriers stop working for example then the Trust loses income so they have to be repaired. Health and safety issues are also a priority so if lighting needs to be addressed or the carpark re-tarmacked these repairs have to be undertaken. The Director of Asset Management and ICT was clear that the fundamental capital elements of maintaining carparks' could not be put off.
- 4.5 The cost of maintaining and running the carpark at the Redditch hospital site was approximately £110k in pay and £113k in non-pay costs (for example gritting, repairs, security and lighting) and the costs at the Kidderminster hospital site was approximately £30k in pay and £40k in non-pay costs. This reflected the different size and usage of the carparks at the hospital sites as detailed below.
- Alexandra Hospital - total spaces 940 (split 641 staff and 299 visitors) plus 33 disabled spaces (located in visitor car park).
 - Kidderminster Hospital - total spaces 379 (split 188 staff and 191 visitors) plus 19 disabled spaces (includes some in use by the Health & Care Trust).
 - Worcestershire Royal Hospital (inc 3 Kings Court) - 1239 staff and patients including 75 disabled plus 120 at 3 Kings Court ie total of 1359 of which 778 are staff spaces and 609 are visitor spaces.
- 4.6 At the Worcestershire Royal Hospital site the costs are approximately £140k in pay and £624k in non-pay costs. Non pay costs include an expensive park and ride bus service which is used by hospital staff and £80k in rent for the Blue Carpark as this is situated on private land.

5. Income Generated

- 5.1 The Trust provided the information below regarding the income generated from car parking charges.

Table 2 - Worcestershire Acute Hospitals NHS Trust Car Parking Income & Expenditure Summary Financial Years 2013/14 - 2016/17

	2013/14	2014/15	2015/16	2016/17
	Total	Total	Total	Total
	£	£	£	£
Staff Parking Deductions	-593,219	-667,275	-647,613	-646,981
Car Parking Income - Patients	-1,540,384	-1,624,504	-1,909,468	-1,904,114
Q1 Income subtotal	-2,133,603	-2,291,779	-2,557,081	-2,551,096
Direct Revenue Expenditure	651,774	822,216	896,309	1,051,494
Depreciation	60,000	108,971	79,494	79,494
Unitary Payment		719,106	731,060	688,188
Capital Costs	280,000	15,000	298,185	208,309
Expenditure subtotal	991,774	1,665,292	2,005,049	2,027,485
Surplus Income	-1,141,829	-626,487	-552,033	-523,611

5.2 Members' noted that the Trust has made approximately half a million pounds from car parking charges each year for the past couple of years. Any surplus income from car parking charges goes back into the operation of the Trust, with the income generated included in the Trust's budget. It was acknowledged that the Trust is struggling financially and if it could not charge for parking, then the amount invested in hospital services could reduce.

6. The National Picture

- 6.1 During the course of the Board's Investigation, Members considered Hospital Car Parking Charges legislation in the United Kingdom. Reference was made to a January 2018 House of Commons Library briefing paper which summarised that; *'Trusts and Foundation Trusts in England are permitted to charge for car parking and to raise revenue from it as long as certain rules are followed: income generation activities must not interfere to a significant degree with the provision of NHS core services, they must be profitable, and this profit must be used to improve health services.'*
- 6.2 Elsewhere in the UK hospital car parking charges have been abolished. Members' considered the situation in Scotland where by a decision was made to abolish parking charges from the 31st December 2008. Although this was the case, it was noted that charges still remained at three hospitals in Scotland, built under PFI contracts.
- 6.3 Whilst the Board Investigation was underway a Private Members Bill was put forward by Robert Halfon MP to abolish hospital car parking charges in England. The Bill stated that; *'It shall be a duty of the Secretary of State to secure that, in England, health care providers do not levy charges on patients, staff or visitors for the use of car parking spaces at NHS hospitals.'* The Bill was due to have its second reading on Friday 15th June 2018 and if it passed

would move to the Committee Stage where by each clause and any amendments would be debated, raising wider awareness of the issue

- 6.4 Members noted the contents of this Bill which had cross party support and also that the matter had been debated in Parliament previously and that there were a number of Early Day Motions on the matter.

7. Background Papers

Concessionary Car Parking Tickets, Worcestershire Acute Hospitals NHS Trust, 18th February 2015

<http://moderngovwebpublic.bromsgrove.gov.uk/documents/s34412/Concessionary%20Parking%20Policy.pdf>

Hospital Car Parking Charges, House of Commons Library, 31st January 2018

<http://researchbriefings.files.parliament.uk/documents/CDP-2018-0026/CDP-20180026.pdf>

NHS patient, visitor and staff car parking principles, Department of Health and Social Care, Updated 29th October 2015

<https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/nhs-patient-visitor-and-staff-car-parking-principles/nhs-patient-visitor-and-staff-car-parking-principles>

Private Members Bill to Abolish Hospital Car Parking Charges in England, House of Commons, 14 November 2017

<https://publications.parliament.uk/pa/bills/cbill/2017-2019/0125/18125.pdf>

AUTHOR OF REPORT

Name: Amanda Scarce, Senior Democratic Services Officer

E Mail: a.scarce@bromsgroveandredditch.gov.uk

Tel: 01527 881443

OVERVIEW & SCRUTINY BOARD

WORK PROGRAMME

2018/19

RECOMMENDATION:

That the Board considers and agrees the work programme and updates it accordingly.

ITEMS FOR FUTURE MEETINGS

Date of Meeting	Subject	Additional Information
30/07/18	MEETING CANCELLED	
03/09/18	Pre-Scrutiny - Council Tax Support Scheme Review	Pre-scrutiny requested by Amanda Singleton
	Anti-social Behaviour, Crime and Policing Act 2014 (Implementation of Provisions)	
	Hospital Car Parking Charges – Board Investigation Final Report (Led by Councillor C. Bloore)	Requested following notice of motion at Council 19/07/17
	Task Group/Short Sharp Review Updates: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Road Safety Around Schools Task and Finish Group • CCTV Short Sharp Review 	
	WCC Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee – update from Representative	
	Cabinet Leader’s Work Programme O&S Board Work Programme	
01/10/18	Road Safety Around Schools Task and Finish Group Final Report	
	Task Group/Short Sharp Review Updates: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • CCTV Short Sharp Review Report 	
	WCC Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee – update from Representative	
	Cabinet Leader’s Work Programme	
	O&S Board Work Programme	
29/10/18	Transport Planning Report	
	CCTV Short Sharp Review Report	
	WCC Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee – update from Representative	
	Cabinet Leader’s Work Programme	

Agenda Item 12

Date of Meeting	Subject	Additional Information
	O&S Board Work Programme	
03/12/18	Task Group/Short Sharp Review Updates:	
	WCC Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee – update from Representative	
	Cabinet Leader’s Work Programme	
	O&S Board Work Programme	
14/01/19	Task Group/Short Sharp Review Updates:	
	WCC Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee – update from Representative	
	Cabinet Leader’s Work Programme	
	O&S Board Work Programme	
11/02/19	Bromsgrove Sports and Physical Activity Strategy	Picked up from the Cabinet Leader’s Work Programme
	Task Group/Short Sharp Review Updates:	
	WCC Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee – update from Representative	
	Cabinet Leader’s Work Programme	
	O&S Board Work Programme	
04/03/19	Task Group/Short Sharp Review Updates:	
	WCC Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee – update from Representative	
	Cabinet Leader’s Work Programme	
	O&S Board Work Programme	
08/04/19	Task Group/Short Sharp Review Updates:	
	WCC Health Overview & Scrutiny Committee – update from Representative	
	Cabinet Leader’s Work Programme	
	O&S Board Work Programme	

Topic Proposals for future further consideration.

- Paperless Bromsgrove
- Review of the sports hall negotiation process

Updates Received - Monthly

The Council's representative on the Worcestershire Health Overview and Scrutiny Committee provides a verbal update to the Board each month.

The Council's representative on any Joint Scrutiny Task Group's will be expected to provide an update (verbal or written) on the work of that Group at each Board meeting.

The Chairman of any Working Group, Task Group or Short Sharp Review set up by the Board will be expected to provide a written or verbal update in respect of the work being carried out and progress of the investigation by the Group Members.

Reports to be Received by the Board (at its discretion)

Write Off of Debts Report (last report received by Finance & Budget Working Group on 9th November 2017))

Sickness Absence Performance - biannually (last report received 31/10/16)

Making Experiences Count (last report received 27/06/16)

Summary of Environmental Enforcement (last report received 08/08/16)

When considering topics for investigations Members may wish to take into account the Council's Strategic Purposes as detailed below:

Our Strategic Purposes for Bromsgrove



Help me to live my life independently

Help me to be financially independent

Keep my place safe & looking good

Help me find somewhere to live in my locality

Provide good things for me to see, do & visit

Help me run a successful business

Support services enable us to deliver our purposes

Bromsgrove District Council
www.bromsgrove.gov.uk

For more information view the Council Plan at:
<http://www.bromsgrove.gov.uk/cms/council-and-democracy/council-plan.aspx>